About Borel and almost Borel embeddings for \mathbb{Z}^d actions

Nishant Chandgotia

Tata institute of Fundamental Research - Centre for Applicable Mathematics

May, Descriptive Dynamics and Combinatorics Seminar at McGill University

In this talk we will report results with Tom Meyerovitch (2020), ongoing work with Spencer Unger and some open questions.



Let X be a Polish space and consider a \mathbb{Z}^d action T on X by homeomorphisms.

Framework

Let X be a Polish space and consider a \mathbb{Z}^d action T on X by homeomorphisms.

By \mathbb{Z}^d , we will also mean the Cayley graph with standard generators.

Framework

Let X be a Polish space and consider a \mathbb{Z}^d action T on X by homeomorphisms.

By \mathbb{Z}^d , we will also mean the Cayley graph with standard generators.

We want to understand the assumptions on the dynamical system (X, T) which implies that it is 'universal'.

Framework

Let X be a Polish space and consider a \mathbb{Z}^d action T on X by homeomorphisms.

By \mathbb{Z}^d , we will also mean the Cayley graph with standard generators.

We want to understand the assumptions on the dynamical system (X, T) which implies that it is 'universal'.

By 'universal' we mean that 'any' free system (Y, S) (with low enough entropy) can be Borel embedded into (X, T).

In this talk we focus on colouring of actions as an example.

Chromatic number

The chromatic number of a graph is the minimum number of colours required to properly colour the graph.



The chromatic number of \mathbb{Z}^d is 2.

Chromatic number of an action

If \mathbb{Z}^d acts on a Polish space X in a free manner then this induces a natural Borel graph structure on it.

Chromatic number of an action

If \mathbb{Z}^d acts on a Polish space X in a free manner then this induces a natural Borel graph structure on it.

What is the chromatic number of this action?

Chromatic number of an action

If \mathbb{Z}^d acts on a Polish space X in a free manner then this induces a natural Borel graph structure on it.

What is the chromatic number of this action?

In other words in what is the minimum k such that we can partition $X := \bigsqcup_{i=1}^{k} X_i$ into Borel sets such that if $x \in X_j$ then the neighbours of x are in $\bigcup_{i \neq j} X_i$.

The chromatic number is 'usually' not 2

Let (X, T) be a \mathbb{Z}^d action by homeomorphisms.

The chromatic number is 'usually' not 2

Let (X, T) be a \mathbb{Z}^d action by homeomorphisms.

Suppose $X := X_1 \sqcup X_2$ such that if $x \in X_1$ then $T^{\vec{e}}(x) \in X_2$ for all unit vectors \vec{e} .

The chromatic number is 'usually' not 2

Let (X, T) be a \mathbb{Z}^d action by homeomorphisms.

Suppose $X := X_1 \sqcup X_2$ such that if $x \in X_1$ then $T^{\vec{e}}(x) \in X_2$ for all unit vectors \vec{e} .

This would mean that if μ is an invariant measure for the action then $\mu(X_1) = \mu(X_2) = 1/2$ and both X_1 and X_2 are invariant under T^2 . Hence T^2 is not ergodic.

Gao and Jackson asked what is the chromatic number of a free Polish action of \mathbb{Z}^d ?

Gao and Jackson asked what is the chromatic number of a free Polish action of \mathbb{Z}^d ?

Kechris, Solecki and Todorcevic (1999) had showed that the chromatic number is it is between 2 and 2d + 1.

Gao and Jackson asked what is the chromatic number of a free Polish action of \mathbb{Z}^d ?

Kechris, Solecki and Todorcevic (1999) had showed that the chromatic number is it is between 2 and 2d + 1.

Gao and Jackson (2015) showed that it is between 2 and 4.

Theorem (Chandgotia & Unger, and by Gao, Jackson, Krohne & Seward) The chromatic number of a free \mathbb{Z}^d action on a Polish space is either 2 or 3.

We will now see a sketch of the proof.

We start with a theorem by Rokhlin.

Theorem (Rokhlin 1948 for d = 1 / Katznelson & Weiss 1972 for d > 1) Let (X, T) be a free \mathbb{Z}^d action and $\epsilon > 0$ and $n \in \mathbb{N}$. Then there exists $A \subset X$ such that We start with a theorem by Rokhlin.

Theorem (Rokhlin 1948 for d = 1 / Katznelson & Weiss 1972 for d > 1) Let (X, T) be a free \mathbb{Z}^d action and $\epsilon > 0$ and $n \in \mathbb{N}$. Then there exists $A \subset X$ such that $T^{\vec{e}}A$; $\vec{e} \in [1, n]^d$ are disjoint and

$$\mu(\sqcup_{\vec{e}\in[1,n]^d}T^{\vec{e}}(A))>1-\epsilon$$

for all invariant measures μ .

We start with a theorem by Rokhlin.

Theorem (Rokhlin 1948 for d = 1 / Katznelson & Weiss 1972 for d > 1) Let (X, T) be a free \mathbb{Z}^d action and $\epsilon > 0$ and $n \in \mathbb{N}$. Then there exists $A \subset X$ such that $T^{\vec{e}}A$; $\vec{e} \in [1, n]^d$ are disjoint and

$$\mu(\sqcup_{\vec{e}\in[1,n]^d}T^{\vec{e}}(A))>1-\epsilon$$

for all invariant measures μ .

How can we properly colour the space using this?















Given a \mathbb{Z}^d action (X, T), a set is called a full set if $\mu(X') = 1$ for invariant probability measures μ .

Theorem (Şahin-Robinson, 2004)

Let (X, T) be a free \mathbb{Z}^d action. There exists a proper 3-colouring of a full set $X' \subset X$.

Given a \mathbb{Z}^d action (X, T), a set is called a full set if $\mu(X') = 1$ for invariant probability measures μ .

Theorem (Şahin-Robinson, 2004)

Let (X, T) be a free \mathbb{Z}^d action. There exists a proper 3-colouring of a full set $X' \subset X$.

Strictly speaking, the map was defined for every ergodic probability measure on a set of measure one but this extension is not difficult.

Given a \mathbb{Z}^d action (X, T), a set is called a full set if $\mu(X') = 1$ for invariant probability measures μ .

Theorem (Şahin-Robinson, 2004)

Let (X, T) be a free \mathbb{Z}^d action. There exists a proper 3-colouring of a full set $X' \subset X$.

Strictly speaking, the map was defined for every ergodic probability measure on a set of measure one but this extension is not difficult.

Here they raised a very important question. If (X, T) has low enough entropy then can we recover the action (X,T) from its colouring? In other words, can the colouring be made into an embedding.

Given a \mathbb{Z}^d action (X, T), a set is called a full set if $\mu(X') = 1$ for invariant probability measures μ .

Theorem (Şahin-Robinson, 2004)

Let (X, T) be a free \mathbb{Z}^d action. There exists a proper 3-colouring of a full set $X' \subset X$.

Strictly speaking, the map was defined for every ergodic probability measure on a set of measure one but this extension is not difficult.

Here they raised a very important question. If (X, T) has low enough entropy then can we recover the action (X,T) from its colouring? In other words, can the colouring be made into an embedding.

The answer is yes.

Given a \mathbb{Z}^d action (X, T), by its entropy, we mean the Gurevic entropy, that is, the supermum of the measure theoretic entropy on the space.

Given a \mathbb{Z}^d action (X, T), by its entropy, we mean the Gurevic entropy, that is, the supermum of the measure theoretic entropy on the space.

You can assume that it is some measure of size / complexity of the action (X, T).

Theorem (Chandgotia, Meyerovitch 2021)

Let (X, T) be a free \mathbb{Z}^d action of entropy less than the space of 3-colourings. There exists a full set $X' \subset X$ which can be embedded into the space of proper 3-colourings in an equivariant manner.

Theorem (Chandgotia, Meyerovitch 2021)

Let (X, T) be a free \mathbb{Z}^d action of entropy less than the space of 3-colourings. There exists a full set $X' \subset X$ which can be embedded into the space of proper 3-colourings in an equivariant manner.

In other words the space of proper 3-colourings is 'almost' universal.
Let (X, T) be a free \mathbb{Z}^d action of entropy less than the space of 3-colourings. There exists a full set $X' \subset X$ which can be embedded into the space of proper 3-colourings in an equivariant manner.

In other words the space of proper 3-colourings is 'almost' universal. Almost - because we could not do it for the entire space but had to leave out a null set.

Let (X, T) be a free \mathbb{Z}^d action of entropy less than the space of 3-colourings. There exists a full set $X' \subset X$ which can be embedded into the space of proper 3-colourings in an equivariant manner.

In other words the space of proper 3-colourings is 'almost' universal. Almost - because we could not do it for the entire space but had to leave out a null set. Indeed $\mu(X \setminus X') = 0$ for all invariant probability measures μ .

Let (X, T) be a free \mathbb{Z}^d action of entropy less than the space of 3-colourings. There exists a full set $X' \subset X$ which can be embedded into the space of proper 3-colourings in an equivariant manner.

In other words the space of proper 3-colourings is 'almost' universal. Almost - because we could not do it for the entire space but had to leave out a null set. Indeed $\mu(X \setminus X') = 0$ for all invariant probability measures μ .

Question

Prove that the space of proper 3-colourings is universal, that is, there is no need to get rid of null set to obtain an embedding.

Let (X, T) be a free \mathbb{Z}^d action of entropy less than the space of 3-colourings. There exists a full set $X' \subset X$ which can be embedded be embedded into the space of proper 3-colourings in an equivariant manner.

Our techniques are fairly general and apply to a large class of examples:

(1) Space of homomorphisms from \mathbb{Z}^d to a non-bipartite graph.

Let (X, T) be a free \mathbb{Z}^d action of entropy less than the space of 3-colourings. There exists a full set $X' \subset X$ which can be embedded be embedded into the space of proper 3-colourings in an equivariant manner.

- (1) Space of homomorphisms from \mathbb{Z}^d to a non-bipartite graph.
- 2 The space of domino tilings.

Let (X, T) be a free \mathbb{Z}^d action of entropy less than the space of 3-colourings. There exists a full set $X' \subset X$ which can be embedded be embedded into the space of proper 3-colourings in an equivariant manner.

- (1) Space of homomorphisms from \mathbb{Z}^d to a non-bipartite graph.
- ② The space of domino tilings.
- 3 The space of tilings by rectangular tiles (there is an h < entropy of the tilings such that we can embed (X, T) whose entropy is smaller than h).

Let (X, T) be a free \mathbb{Z}^d action of entropy less than the space of 3-colourings. There exists a full set $X' \subset X$ which can be embedded be embedded into the space of proper 3-colourings in an equivariant manner.

- (1) Space of homomorphisms from \mathbb{Z}^d to a non-bipartite graph.
- ② The space of domino tilings.
- **3** The space of tilings by rectangular tiles (there is an h < entropy of the tilings such that we can embed (X, T) whose entropy is smaller than h).
- ④ Space with non-uniform specification.

- (1) Space of homomorphisms from \mathbb{Z}^d to a non-bipartite graph.
- 2 The space of domino tilings.
- 3 The space of tilings by rectangular tiles (there is an h < entropy of the tilings such that we can embed (X, T) whose entropy is smaller than h).
- ④ Space with non-uniform specification.

- (1) Space of homomorphisms from \mathbb{Z}^d to a non-bipartite graph.
- 2 The space of domino tilings.
- 3 The space of tilings by rectangular tiles (there is an h < entropy of the tilings such that we can embed (X, T) whose entropy is smaller than h).
- ④ Space with non-uniform specification.

Our results built upon techniques developed by Hochman (2013), who proved the same result for the full shift in one dimension (strengthening the result for Krieger-1972).

- (1) Space of homomorphisms from \mathbb{Z}^d to a non-bipartite graph.
- 2 The space of domino tilings.
- 3 The space of tilings by rectangular tiles (there is an h < entropy of the tilings such that we can embed (X, T) whose entropy is smaller than h).
- ④ Space with non-uniform specification.

Şahin and Robinson (2002) proved universality for certain systems assuming certain mixing conditions (which is not satisfied by the systems given above).

- **(1)** Space of homomorphisms from \mathbb{Z}^d to a non-bipartite graph.
- ② The space of domino tilings.
- 3 The space of tilings by rectangular tiles (there is an h < entropy of the tilings such that we can embed (X, T) whose entropy is smaller than h).
- ④ Space with non-uniform specification.

For the space of domino tilings we needed an estimate which was known in d = 2 due to Kastelyn (1968) and was recently proved by me for d > 2.

What combinatorial estimate do we need?- A major open question

Consider a set of rectangles T_1, T_2, \ldots, T_p such that

gcd(dimension of T_i in the *k*th direction; $1 \le i \le p$) = 1 for all *k*.

Let N be the product of the side lengths. We need to compare perfect tilings of a Nk-box and tilings without any boundary restriction.

Question

Prove that

$$\lim_{k \to \infty} \frac{\log \#(\text{perfect tilings of a } [1, Nk]^d)}{\log \#(\text{ tilings of a } [1, Nk]^d)} = 1.$$

- (1) Space of homomorphisms from \mathbb{Z}^d to a non-bipartite graph.
- 2 The space of domino tilings.
- 3 The space of tilings by rectangular tiles (there is an h < entropy of the tilings such that we can embed (X, T) whose entropy is smaller than h).
- A (X, T) is space with non-uniform specification.

With the last item we were answering a question by Quas and Soo (2012) who proved this with some additional hypothesis.

A nice corollary of our work is the following:

Theorem (Chandgotia, Meyerovitch 2021)

A generic homeomorphism (with respect to the sup-metric) of any manifold of dimension > 1 is almost universal.

We believe that adjective almost is unnecessary.

What problems are encountered getting rid of the 'almost'?



We needed that all most every point of the space X belongs to at most finitely many boundaries of Rokhlin towers.

This no longer holds in the Polish setting.

Theorem (Gao, Jackson and Krohne, 2015)

Let $d \ge 2$ and (X, T) be a \mathbb{Z}^d minimal dynamical system such that the subsystem with respect to $\mathbb{Z} \times \{0\}^{d-1}$ is also minimal.

Theorem (Gao, Jackson and Krohne, 2015)

Let $d \ge 2$ and (X, T) be a \mathbb{Z}^d minimal dynamical system such that the subsystem with respect to $\mathbb{Z} \times \{0\}^{d-1}$ is also minimal. Given a sequence of Borel sets $B_n \subset X$ with the following properties:

Theorem (Gao, Jackson and Krohne, 2015)

Let $d \ge 2$ and (X, T) be a \mathbb{Z}^d minimal dynamical system such that the subsystem with respect to $\mathbb{Z} \times \{0\}^{d-1}$ is also minimal. Given a sequence of Borel sets $B_n \subset X$ with the following properties:

1 B_n is a complete section.

Theorem (Gao, Jackson and Krohne, 2015)

Let $d \ge 2$ and (X, T) be a \mathbb{Z}^d minimal dynamical system such that the subsystem with respect to $\mathbb{Z} \times \{0\}^{d-1}$ is also minimal. Given a sequence of Borel sets $B_n \subset X$ with the following properties:

- **1** B_n is a complete section.
- 2 The connected components of B_n are finite rectangles growing in size.

Theorem (Gao, Jackson and Krohne, 2015)

Let $d \ge 2$ and (X, T) be a \mathbb{Z}^d minimal dynamical system such that the subsystem with respect to $\mathbb{Z} \times \{0\}^{d-1}$ is also minimal. Given a sequence of Borel sets $B_n \subset X$ with the following properties:

- **1** B_n is a complete section.
- 2 The connected components of B_n are finite rectangles growing in size.

Then the set

$$\{x \in X : x \in \partial B_n \text{ for infinitely many } n\}$$

is comeager.

Gao, Jackson and Seward also suggested a workaround. A proof of this can be found in a paper by Marks and Unger.

Gao, Jackson and Seward's walkaround



While this suggests a walk around, it can be very complicated to use this path even in the simplest cases.

While this suggests a walk around, it can be very complicated to use this path even in the simplest cases. It seems almost impossible to use this to prove embedding results. While this suggests a walk around, it can be very complicated to use this path even in the simplest cases. It seems almost impossible to use this to prove embedding results.

Nevertheless we are able to use this to prove the correct bound for the chromatic number.

While this suggests a walk around, it can be very complicated to use this path even in the simplest cases. It seems almost impossible to use this to prove embedding results.

Nevertheless we are able to use this to prove the correct bound for the chromatic number.

Theorem (Chandgotia & Unger, and by Gao, Jackson, Krohne & Seward) The chromatic number of a free \mathbb{Z}^d action on a Polish space is either 2 or 3. Theorem (Chandgotia & Unger, and by Gao, Jackson, Krohne & Seward)

The chromatic number of a free \mathbb{Z}^d action on a Polish space is either 2 or 3.

Again our methods are general enough to show that we can find a factor from any free Polish \mathbb{Z}^d action (X, T) to:

- The space of tilings by rectangles (under some natural necessary conditions).
- ² The space of directed bi-infinite Hamiltonian paths.

The first result extends results of Gao and Jackson who need additional assumptions on the rectangles. It answers question raised by Gao, Jackson and Seward. Theorem (Chandgotia & Unger, and by Gao, Jackson, Krohne & Seward)

The chromatic number of a free \mathbb{Z}^d action on a Polish space is either 2 or 3.

Again our methods are general enough to show that we can find a factor from any free Polish \mathbb{Z}^d action (X, T) to:

- The space of tilings by rectangles (under some natural necessary conditions).
- ² The space of directed bi-infinite Hamiltonian paths.

The second result recovers a result announced by Gao, Jackson, Krohne & Seward. Under presence of an ergodic measure this result was announced by Downarowicz, Oprocha & Zhang.

What is a bi-infinite Hamiltonian path?

A directed Hamiltonian path on a graph is a walk on a graph such that every vertex is visited exactly once



This shows that any \mathbb{Z}^d action on a Polish space (X, T) is orbit equivalent to a \mathbb{Z} action (X, S) such that if $S(x) = T^{\vec{e}}(x)$ for some unit vector \vec{e} (depends on x).

But can we get no embedding results?

Since we already know how to deal with spaces with invariant probability measures, we need to deal with actions with no invariant probability measures.

But can we get no embedding results?

Since we already know how to deal with spaces with invariant probability measures, we need to deal with actions with no invariant probability measures.

There are two breakthrough's which indicate that we might be able to make our way through eventually.

But can we get no embedding results?

Since we already know how to deal with spaces with invariant probability measures, we need to deal with actions with no invariant probability measures.

There are two breakthrough's which indicate that we might be able to make our way through eventually.

Theorem (Tserunyan 2015)

Let (X, T) be the action of a countable group with no invariant probability measures then it can be embedded in the full shift over 32 symbols.

Theorem (Hochman 2019)

Let (X, T) be the action of \mathbb{Z} with no invariant probability measures then it can be embedded in any shift of finite type.

We could in the mean time obtain some intermediate results.

We could in the mean time obtain some intermediate results.

Theorem (Chandgotia & Unger)

Let (X, T) be a \mathbb{Z}^d shift space whose entropy is smaller than that of the space of 3-colourings. Then the free part of X can be Borel embedded in the space of 3-colourings.

We could in the mean time obtain some intermediate results.

Theorem (Chandgotia & Unger)

Let (X, T) be a \mathbb{Z}^d shift space whose entropy is smaller than that of the space of 3-colourings. Then the free part of X can be Borel embedded in the space of 3-colourings.

Again this can be generalised to tilings, the space of bi-infinite Hamiltonian paths.
We could in the mean time obtain some intermediate results.

Theorem (Chandgotia & Unger)

Let (X, T) be a \mathbb{Z}^d shift space whose entropy is smaller than that of the space of 3-colourings. Then the free part of X can be Borel embedded in the space of 3-colourings.

Again this can be generalised to tilings, the space of bi-infinite Hamiltonian paths.

Our methods are completely different from the previous proofs of such results but restricted to symbolic spaces.

In this category, it can be asked whether these embeddings can be made continuous.

In this category, it can be asked whether these embeddings can be made continuous.

Theorem (Gao & Jackson 2015)

A continuous 3-colouring of the free part of the 2-full shift does not exist (but a 4-colouring does).

Theorem (Salo, 2021)

There is no continuous embedding of the space of proper 3 colourings into the 2 full shift.

(1) Prove that there exists universal subshifts whose entropies form a dense set in $\mathbb{R}.$

- Prove that there exists universal subshifts whose entropies form a dense set in R.
- 2 Let (X, T) and (Y, S) be dynamical systems. Suppose there is a bijection φ from the space of invariant ergodic probability measures on (X, T) to those on (Y, S) such that (X, μ, T) is isomorphic to (Y, φ(μ), S).

- Prove that there exists universal subshifts whose entropies form a dense set in R.
- 2 Let (X, T) and (Y, S) be dynamical systems. Suppose there is a bijection ϕ from the space of invariant ergodic probability measures on (X, T) to those on (Y, S) such that (X, μ, T) is isomorphic to $(Y, \phi(\mu), S)$. Is (X, T) isomorphic to (Y, S) (up to universally null sets)?

- Prove that there exists universal subshifts whose entropies form a dense set in R.
- 2 Let (X, T) and (Y, S) be dynamical systems. Suppose there is a bijection ϕ from the space of invariant ergodic probability measures on (X, T) to those on (Y, S) such that (X, μ, T) is isomorphic to $(Y, \phi(\mu), S)$. Is (X, T) isomorphic to (Y, S) (up to universally null sets)?
- 3 Let T be a set of coprime boxes. Let N be the product of length of the sides of T. Prove that

 $\lim_{n\to\infty}\frac{1}{N^d n^d}\log(\text{the number of tilings of }[1,Nn]^d \text{ by elements of }\mathbb{T})=\text{ topological entropy of all the tilings of }\mathbb{T}.$

- Prove that there exists universal subshifts whose entropies form a dense set in R.
- 2 Let (X, T) and (Y, S) be dynamical systems. Suppose there is a bijection ϕ from the space of invariant ergodic probability measures on (X, T) to those on (Y, S) such that (X, μ, T) is isomorphic to $(Y, \phi(\mu), S)$. Is (X, T) isomorphic to (Y, S) (up to universally null sets)?
- 3 Let T be a set of coprime boxes. Let N be the product of length of the sides of T. Prove that

 $\lim_{n\to\infty}\frac{1}{N^d n^d}\log(\text{the number of tilings of }[1,Nn]^d \text{ by elements of }\mathbb{T})=\text{ topological entropy of all the tilings of }\mathbb{T}.$

④ \mathbb{R}^d actions?

- Prove that there exists universal subshifts whose entropies form a dense set in R.
- 2 Let (X, T) and (Y, S) be dynamical systems. Suppose there is a bijection ϕ from the space of invariant ergodic probability measures on (X, T) to those on (Y, S) such that (X, μ, T) is isomorphic to $(Y, \phi(\mu), S)$. Is (X, T) isomorphic to (Y, S) (up to universally null sets)?
- 3 Let T be a set of coprime boxes. Let N be the product of length of the sides of T. Prove that

 $\lim_{n\to\infty}\frac{1}{N^d n^d}\log(\text{the number of tilings of }[1,Nn]^d \text{ by elements of }\mathbb{T})=\text{ topological entropy of all the tilings of }\mathbb{T}.$

- ④ \mathbb{R}^d actions?
- ⑤ Continuous category













